



Animal Welfare Certification Programs

Understanding Opportunities and Costs

Related to

Certifications for Humane Farm Animal Treatment^{1,2}

¹ Paper prepared by David Weiss, Graduate Student, Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics, Colorado State University (dww Weiss@lamar.colostate.edu); and Martha Sullins, Extension Specialist, Colorado State University (Martha.Sullins@colostate.edu).

² Funded by the USDA National Institute for Food and Agriculture (NIFA) Beginning Farmer and Rancher Development Program under award #2009-49400-05871.

<u>Table of Contents</u>	<u>Page</u>
I. Overview – Understanding Opportunities and Costs	2
Types of labels and certifications.....	4
II. Profiles of Leading Certification Programs.....	5
1. Animal Welfare Approved.....	5
2. HFAC Certified Humane	6
3. USDA Certified Organic	8
4. Global Animal Partnership	10
5. American Humane Certified.....	12
6. Food Alliance	13
7. Certified Naturally Grown	15
8. AGA Grassfed and Pasture Finished.....	16
9. Kosher	17
10. Halal and Zabiha Halal	19
III. Comparison of Animal Welfare Standards by Program.....	21
Living Conditions – Beef Cattle.....	22
Living Conditions – Chickens	23
Living Conditions – Pigs	24
Living Conditions – Goats & Sheep	25
Living Conditions – Turkeys.....	26
IV. Characteristics of Poultry Certifications and Labels	28
Poultry Labels.....	28
V. Glossary.....	30



I. Overview – Understanding Opportunities and Costs

The welfare of animals raised for food production is a matter of growing importance to both U.S. consumers and producers. As more consumers seek out labels assuring them that the products they buy are coming from humanely treated farm animals, producers increasingly are considering commitment to animal welfare a moral, and corporate, responsibility.

The past few decades have witnessed a pronounced growth in the number of organizations that provide animal welfare certifications to producers. Recently, the increased focus on the issue of farm animal well-being has helped alter the production policies of supply chain partners to corporations as large as McDonald's.

According to a February 2012 *Lempert Report*, a number of large producers made significant commitments in 2011 to sourcing ethically treated animals and animal products. Highlighted in the report were the following:

- Both Hormel Foods and Smithfield Foods, the largest pork producer in the U.S., recommitted to a 2017 phase-out of gestation crates on company-owned farms;
- Unilever and Hyatt Hotels committed to serving 100 percent cage-free shell eggs;
- ConAgra and General Mills each agreed to sourcing one million cage-free eggs annually; and
- McDonald's agreed to source 12 million cage-free shell eggs annually.

This document seeks to help livestock producers navigate the many animal welfare certifications and labels available and to identify which may be most appropriate and desirable for their livestock production and marketing operations. The following key components of each certification program are highlighted:

1. description of the program's primary goals;
2. animals included in the program;
3. certification requirements;
4. certification procedures,
5. fees and timelines;
6. scale considerations;
7. potential changes to production costs;
8. benefits of certification, including access to new markets and potentially higher revenue streams, as well as marketability of the program label; and
9. contact information for each program.

For each certification program, a core set of principles outline the creation of treatment standards that, as a result, are similar across species. Generally, each program or label adopts an animal treatment philosophy and then identifies species-specific criteria with which a producer must comply to be certified.

Section II of this document highlights aspects of eight well-known certification programs whose standards are similar across livestock species. The programs that are profiled include: Animal Welfare Approved, Certified Humane, USDA's National Organic Program, Global Animal Partnership, American Humane Certified, Food Alliance, Certified Naturally Grown, and American Grassfed Association Grassfed and Pasture Finished Standards. Also profiled at the end of this section are "kosher" and "halal" standards.

In Section III, animal welfare standards of five leading programs are compared side-by-side. Individual sections regarding living conditions for beef cattle, chickens, pigs, sheep and goats, and turkeys are included.

Section IV is a table displaying characteristics of different poultry certifications and labels and, finally, Section V offers a glossary of key terms related to animal welfare certifications and labels.

Types of labels and certifications

A significant challenge facing livestock producers seeking to differentiate their products is distinguishing between labels that are based on certification standards issued by organizations and institutions such as Humane Farm Animal Care (HFAC) and the USDA, and those that contain appealing language but are not based on any certification and, in some cases, can mislead the consumer. General definitions of the different types of certifications and labels are provided below. The glossary at the end of the document further clarifies the significance of commonly used terms associated with certifications and labels.

1. **First-Party Certification:** Determination by a producer that they abide by animal welfare standards of a certifying organization. None of the leading certifying organizations profiled in this document provides for first-party certifications.
2. **Second-Party Certification:** Acknowledgement by a certifying organization that a producer is in compliance with that organization's animal welfare standards. A notable example of a second-party certification is Animal Welfare Approved, which does not use independent auditors. In other cases, second-party certification takes the form of a review by the certifying organization of a third-party's audit information.
3. **Third-Party Certification:** Determination by an independent and authorized auditor that a producer is in compliance with the animal welfare standards of a certifying organization. Most prominent animal welfare certifications require an audit by an independent, approved third-party as part of the certification process.
4. **Marketing Label:** Not based on any formalized certification, some labels are designed to help make a product more appealing to a particular market. Two examples of regionally used marketing labels are membership labels affiliated with Colorado Proud and Be Local Northern Colorado.



II. Profiles of Leading Certification Programs

1. Animal Welfare Approved	
Summary	Animal Welfare Approved (AWA) is a second-party animal welfare certification program that audits and certifies family farms' humane treatment of their animals according to the standards of the World Society for the Protection of Animals. There are no costs associated with the certification process.
Animals	Beef cattle, dairy cattle, pigs, laying hens, meat chickens, turkeys, duck, geese, sheep, goats, bison and rabbits
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The basic premise of all the standards is that animals must be able to behave naturally and be in a state of physical and psychological well-being. Specifically, Animal Welfare Approved: • Requires that animals be raised on pasture or range and that the amount of outdoor area must be such that the health and welfare of the animals and range and forage quality is maintained; • Prohibits dual production (milk and meat) of animals; • Awards approval only to family farmers; and • Charges no fees to participating farmers. • These standards address every aspect of each species' lifecycle needs. • Detailed certification requirements can be found on the AWA website: http://www.animalwelfareapproved.org.
Certification & Re-Certification Process and Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fill out an Animal Welfare Approved application online: http://www.animalwelfareapproved.org/farmerinquiry.php. • AWA will contact the farmer to discuss the application process and to schedule a farm visit. • A qualified AWA program auditor will visit the farm to perform a confidential audit. • AWA will complete a review of slaughter facilities to ensure compliance with AWA standards. • Once the above reviews are completed, the farmer will sign an affidavit agreeing to abide by AWA standards and to allow one or more annual inspections to re-certify compliance. • Application to the AWA program, as well as re-certification, is free.
Timeline	Typically a few months, but varies according to preparedness of the farm and availability of the farmer.
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AWA is a viable certification for any operation that meets its stringent standards. • Certification is available only to family farmers and cooperatives of family farmers (i.e., any farm organized as a sole proprietorship, partnership, or family corporation). • Operations of varying sizes may have difficulty accessing adequate pasture for larger livestock, especially in areas where animal units are restricted due to forage quality and quantity.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive record-keeping, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Which animals have been brought into the farm and which have been sold – whether that is individual birds or animals (breeding stock or meat) or products of livestock – milk, eggs, wool

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Any animals that became ill, were treated or died, and the reason why (if known) ○ Any animals that were born and reared ○ What the animals are fed, and how much <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Large pasture acreage per animal ● Alterations or additions to animal facilities ● Minimum space requirements for animals during transport ● Adherence to specific animal health care standards ● Compliance with pest and rodent control requirements
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Several Colorado grocery stores and restaurants are recognized for selling AWA-certified beef. A complete list of Colorado AWA-certified beef retailers can be found on the AWA website: http://www.animalwelfareapproved.org/product-search
Labeling & Other Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● AWA provides members labeling and marketing materials, as well as assistance designing labels. ● Offers Good Husbandry Grants to help improve welfare on farms. ● Members of the American Grassfed Association may be audited for both the Animal Welfare Approved standards and AGA standards, allowing for dual certification if standards for both organizations are met. ● AWA offers technical advice and marketing support to members.
Notes	A comparison of animal welfare standards among profiled certification programs indicates that AWA's are the most stringent standards.
Contact Information	Web: http://www.animalwelfareapproved.org Phone: 202-546-5292 Email: info@animalwelfareapproved.org

2. HFAC Certified Humane	
Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Humane Farm Animal Care (HFAC) Certified program is a certification and labeling program that requires the humane treatment of farm animals from birth through slaughter. ● The goal of the program is to improve the lives of farm animals by driving consumer demand for kinder and more responsible farm animal practices and to assure consumers that certified products meet the Certified Humane standards.
Animals	Beef cattle, dairy cows, pigs, poultry, goats, sheep and turkeys.
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Offer sufficient space, shelter and the company of same-species. ● Protect animal health through disease protection measures. ● Assure good nutrition and access to fresh water. ● Feed animals antibiotic- and growth hormone-free food. ● Comply with environmental standards. ● Comply with American Meat Institute Standards (processors). ● Examples of animal-specific requirements include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Dairy cattle – Minimum of four hours daily outdoor exercise required. ○ Pigs – Confinement of pregnant sows to gestation crates is prohibited, and bedding is required. ○ Chickens – Litter for dust bathing is required, and slatted or wire flooring is prohibited. ○ Laying hens – Confinement to wire cages is prohibited, and litter for dust bathing is required.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed certification requirements can be found on the Certified Humane website: http://www.certifiedhumane.org.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consult the Humane Farm Animal Care (HFAC) manual to determine what type of application is appropriate (e.g. individual operator, Pooled Product Operator, Product Manufacturing Operation). Complete the appropriate application, and include the Universal Application for the slaughter plant or processor for dairy and eggs. It is important that the farmer keep detailed records about the history of the animals under his/her care. HFAC will review the application and will contact the farm either to clarify information included in the application or to schedule an inspection of the farm and slaughter/processing plant. The inspector conducts an “exit interview” to discuss his/her findings with the farmer. The inspector then submits the report for a decision to the HFAC offices. Farms that meet HFAC standards and requirements receive certification for one year. Farms must renew their applications and be re-inspected each year. All producers in the program also are subject to unannounced inspections.
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$50 processing fee for the application \$50 fee each time farm submits and Application for Renewal of Certification \$500/day/Inspector fee for HFAC to conduct a farm inspection. Producers in close geographic proximity may split the cost of inspection fees if inspections are scheduled so that the inspector can visit the operations during one trip. Subsidies may be available to help offset the inspection costs for small operations with no more than 50 head of beef cattle. After successfully passing its initial review of the application for certification, an eligible operation may request funds to fully or partially cover its inspection fee. The request is made by submission, to the HFAC office, of a written statement of the reasons that the operation is unable to afford to pay the normal inspection fee. The HFAC Executive Director will determine whether the farm is eligible for a subsidy.
Labeling	Upon issuing a certification, HFAC sends a packet to the producer that includes a CD with logo graphics that the producer can use to create labels. Labels can be used for product packaging, shipping, and at point-of-sale.
Timeline	The certification process typically takes about 30 days. However, it may take a few years for producers who are not in compliance with HFAC standards. During this time, the farmer should document and maintain records on all farm management activities.
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Auditor fees may make certification prohibitively expensive for small farm operations. Securing adequate pasture may be difficult for operations raising larger livestock.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extensive record-keeping, including <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Health history of each animal Which animals have been born on the farm and which have been purchased from another HFAC Certified Humane farm Large pasture acreage per animal Alterations or additions to animal facilities Minimum space requirements for animals during transport Adherence to specific animal health care standards Compliance with pest and rodent control requirements
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A list of Certified Humane product retailers can be found on the Certified Humane website:

	<p>http://www.certifiedhumane.org/index.php?page=where-to-buy. This list includes small grocery stores, farmers' markets and Whole Foods locations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recent studies indicate that animal welfare is more important to consumers of livestock products than factors such as "locally grown," "US grown," or "small scale." Participation in the program has grown rapidly; from 2003 through 2011, Certified Humane expanded from 5 certified producers to 88.
Notes	<p>While Certified Humane standards are stronger than industry guidelines, they permit some industry practices that cause animals to suffer and prevent them from engaging in natural behavior, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Horn removal (cattle) Outdoor access is not required for chickens or pigs
Contact Information	<p>Web: http://www.certifiedhumane.org Phone: 703-435-3883 Email: info@certifiedhumane.org</p>

3. USDA Certified Organic	
Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The USDA's National Organic Program (NOP) develops, implements, and administers national production, handling, and labeling standards for organic agricultural, food and fiber products. The NOP also accredits the certifying agents who inspect organic production and handling operations to certify that they meet USDA standards.
Animals	A wide and unspecified range of domestic livestock species
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organic meat, poultry, eggs and dairy products come from animals that are given no antibiotics or growth hormones. With few exceptions, livestock products that are sold, labeled or represented as organic must be from livestock under continuous organic management from the last third of gestation or hatching. Livestock or edible livestock products that are removed from an organic operation cannot be sold or labeled as organic. The organic farmer must maintain records of the identities of all organically managed animals, as well as both edible and nonedible animal products produced on the farm. Producers of organic livestock and livestock products may not feed their animals a range of drugs, additives and formulas. In addition, ruminants must be grazed throughout the geographical region's entire grazing season, and for a minimum of 120 days per year. Standards for the health care of organic livestock include ensuring a suitable diet, adequate housing, pasture and sanitation conditions, allowance for exercise and freedom of movement, and administration of vaccines and preventive health measures when appropriate. Detailed descriptions of certification requirements can be found on the USDA site: http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/nop.
Certification Process	<p>Small farmers with less than \$5,000 in organic sales are exempt from the certification process, but they still must be truthful in their label claims and comply with the new government standards. Individuals or companies who sell or label a product as organic when they know it does not meet USDA standards can be fined up to \$10,000 for each violation. The required steps for farmers who require certification are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stop administering antibiotics and growth hormones to your animals.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintain accurate and organized production records to demonstrate compliance with NOP standards. This is necessary to obtain and keep organic certification. • Choose a certification agency, a list of which can be found at: http://omri.org/OMRI_who.html. • Obtain an application packet from the certification agency and review the materials inside the packet. Complete and submit an Organic System Plan, along with the completed application to the certifying agent to ensure completeness and compliance with NOP standards. • After the application is reviewed and complete, your certifying body will send an organic inspector to your land or facility. He or she will determine whether you are following your organic plan and complying with NOP standards. The inspector also reviews documents regarding farm and animal management, as well as sales records. Upon completion of the audit, the inspector signs an inspection affidavit and will review any non-compliance issues you may have. Finally, the inspector submits a detailed report to the certifier outlining the inspection findings. • Final review of the plan and detailed report is given by either a committee or grantor that is experienced in organic farming and certification standards.
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An application fee that typically varies from \$400 to \$2000 per year is due when the application is submitted. Annual application fees generally are non-refundable and vary by certification agency. • There also is an inspection fee that usually varies from \$100 to \$20,500 and depends on production volume, farm location and the cost of time/travel for the inspector. • Through the USDA's Organic Cost Share Program, any certified producer or handler can apply for assistance and receive a maximum of \$750 per year and be reimbursed for up to 75% of annual certification costs. To request this assistance, contact the USDA National Organic Program by email at amsadministratoroffice@ams.usda.gov.
Timeline	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends on how long a producer has been in compliance with organic standards, as well as what, if any, changes to the operation the producer must make. • Any livestock production may only be certified after applying exclusively organic substances to its grazing land for three years.
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The non-refundable application fee may dissuade some small farming operations from applying for NOP standards. • However, small farmers with less than \$5,000 in organic sales are exempt from the certification process, and, through the USDA's Organic Cost Share Program, any certified producer or handler can apply for assistance and receive a maximum of \$750 per year and be reimbursed for up to 75% of annual certification costs.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High organic feed costs • Extensive record-keeping, including five years of post-certification records on the raising and slaughter of all certified livestock • Large pasture acreage per animal • Alterations or additions to animal facilities • Minimum space requirements for animals during transport • Adherence to specific animal health care standards • Compliance with pest and rodent control requirements
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organic product sales have grown dramatically in the US, from \$3.6 billion in 1997 to \$24.8 billion in 2009. Organic foods are increasingly found not only in mainstream channels, such as grocery stores and club stores, but also through specialty retailers, farmers' markets, co-ops, and community-supported agriculture (CSAs). • As of January 2012, demand for organic milk, both regionally and nationally, was exceeding

	<p>supply. Meanwhile, organic meat sales increased 150% from 2002 to 2009.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • However, while sales of organic fruits and vegetables have seen the greatest increases, trends of organic meat sales are not as well documented.
Labeling	Certification allows a farm or processing facility to sell, label, and represent their products as Certified USDA Organic.
Notes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The USDA's Organic Cost Share Program can help offset certification fees that otherwise may be prohibitively expensive for small-scale producers. • Many certifying agencies have checklists or plan templates to assist in the conversion to organic, and many universities provide technical assistance with certification plans.
Contact Information	<p>Web: http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSV1.0/nop Phone: 202-720-2791 Email: amsadministratoroffice@ams.usda.gov</p>

4. Global Animal Partnership

4. Global Animal Partnership	
Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Global Animal Partnership is a nonprofit organization founded in 2008 with the goal of improving the welfare of animals in agriculture. • Comprised of farmers, scientists, ranchers, retailers and animal advocates, Global Animal Partnership's 5-Step Animal Welfare Rating Standards program claims that it recognizes producers for their welfare practices, promotes and facilitates continuous improvement, and informs consumers about potentially more efficient and animal-friendly production systems. • Each set of tiered standards, from Step 1 to Step 5+, has its own requirements that must be met before certification to that particular Step level is assigned, and each step rating has its own distinct label that identifies the particular Step level achieved. • Independent, third-party certification companies perform the audits of animal production operations.
Animals	Beef cattle, broiler chickens, pigs and turkeys; developing programs for egg-laying hens and lambs
Key Standards	<p>The specifics of animal welfare standards vary in some cases by species, but the goals for each step essentially are: Step 1: Prohibits cages and crates. Steps 2 – 5+ require: Step 2: environmental enrichment for indoor production systems Step 3: outdoor access Step 4: pasture-based production Step 5: an animal-centered approach with all physical alterations prohibited Step 5+: that the entire life of the animal is spent on an integrated farm</p> <p>These steps are applied to the following categories of animal management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ranch/farm plan and documentation • Breeding and source of animals • Animal health • Animal handling • Animal management • Feed and water • Range/pasture and outdoor requirements • Housing conditions

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insect, rodent and predator control • Movement and transport of animals <p>Specific requirements are laid out in species-specific standards documents on the GAP site: http://www.globalanimalpartnership.org/the-5-step-program/our-standards/.</p>
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review the GAP standards and prepare your farm for audit. • Contact GAP if you have any questions about how standards apply to your operation. • Contact independent, third-party certification companies to discuss scheduling options, as well as audit fees and processes, and select a certifier with whom to contract. • Submit an application to the certification company. • The certifier reviews the application and schedules an audit. • The audit is conducted and is concluded with an exit interview. • The auditor submits the audit form and any relevant supplemental material to the certifier. • The certifier submits a compliance review and may contact the processor directly to get clarification where needed. • The certifier makes a determination on whether to issue a Step certificate or notice of corrective action to the producer. • If corrective action is required, the producer submits evidence to the certifier that issues have adequately been addressed before a final certification decision is made. • After receiving a Step-rating certificate, contact GAP to discuss marketing and labeling guidelines.
Fees	All fees are assessed by third-party auditors and typically are around \$1,500 or higher.
Timeline	The 5-Step certification cycle spans 15 months, over which time farms are audited, and the animals they raise are observed over all four seasons.
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Auditor fees may make certification prohibitively expensive for small farm operations. • Securing adequate pasture may be difficult for operations raising larger livestock.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large pasture acreage per animal • Increased non-pasture feed costs • Alterations or additions to animal facilities • Changes to animal health care practices
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As of year-end 2011, 1,815 operations, raising more than 140 million animals annually, had been audited and certified to Global Animal Partnership's highest welfare Step standards. • Whole Foods Market currently is the highest-profile participant in GAP's animal welfare certification program. • LYFE Kitchen, a restaurant company in California, is serving Step-rated poultry and beef. • GAP currently is in negotiations with other restaurants and grocery chains in an effort to expand membership.
Labeling	Retailers that sell Step-rated animal products are permitted to use proprietary GAP labels on their products.
Notes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • John Mackey, Co-Founder and CEO of Whole Foods Market, is a member of GAP's Board of Directors. • GAP is not part of Whole Foods; however, the retailer was GAP's exclusive pilot partner, and the two entities worked together closely to develop welfare standards during the program's first two years.
Contact Information	<p>Web: http://www.globalanimalpartnership.org Phone: 202-540-9880 Email: info@globalanimalpartnership.org.</p>

5. American Humane Certified	
Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The American Humane Certified (AHC) program (formerly known as the Free Farmed program) provides third-party, independent verification that certified producers' care and handling of farm animals meet the science-based animal welfare standards of American Humane Association (AHA). • The program is a voluntary audit process open to producers of any kind who meet the American Humane Certified standards of raising and handling their animals.
Animals	Beef cattle, bison, broiler chickens, dairy cattle, dairy goats, dairy sheep, laying hens, meat sheep, pigs, turkeys and veal
Key Standards	<p>American Humane Certified standards were built upon the values of the Five Freedoms, which were created by the Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Freedom from hunger and thirst • Freedom from discomfort • Freedom from pain, injury or disease • Freedom to express normal behavior • Freedom from fear and distress <p>In designing its certification standards, the AHA also consulted animal science experts, veterinarians and other animal husbandry specialists. AHC Documents, which detail species specific standards, can be accessed on the American Humane Association website: http://www.americanhumane.org.</p>
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review the standards of care for each species under your care. If you have questions about compliance, or need advice on how to come into compliance before the audit, call the American Humane Association at 303-925-9434. • Submit an online application that provides a description of your operations. Upon completion and submission, AHA will contact you to review your information and to schedule a time for an on-site audit. • AHA works with you to schedule a time for an independent third-party auditor to visit your farm and perform the audit. In limited situations, online video monitoring is used to facilitate the audit process. • Results of the audit are posted to your private, password-protected online account. AHA will work with you to identify corrective action and timetables for any areas that are out of compliance with the standards. With your permission, the AHA will provide your results to specific retailers, processors or foodservice operators whom you request receive the information so that they can verify your certification and audit data. • Audits are performed annually using the same methodology each time. AHA also maintains the right to perform unannounced audits if any issues arise that may jeopardize your certification. • AHA offers training programs, either online or in a classroom setting, as well as hands-on training for all persons involved in animal care. • AHA experts are available to discuss questions you have about either your operations or the program. AHA also will review the design of new facilities and equipment selection as it relates to humane care, as well as provide advice on technologies and trends in humane care.
Fees	<p>AHC assesses all fees associated with certification, according to the following schedule:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Audit fee <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ \$1795 per day for large producers ○ \$900 per day for a ½-day audit of small operations • Administrative fee

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ \$600 for large producers ○ \$300 for small producers
Timeline	From start to finish, the certification process typically takes about 30 days
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Auditor and administrative fees may make certification prohibitively expensive for small farm operations. • Securing adequate pasture may be difficult for operations raising larger livestock.
Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large pasture acreage per animal • Increased costs of non-conventional feed (when used as a supplement to pasture feeding) • Alterations or additions to animal facilities • Adherence to specific animal health care standards
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More than 60 million farm animals are under AHC's program. • Over two-thirds of cage-free egg production in the United States is American Humane Certified. • AHC claims to be the fastest-growing independent animal welfare label program in the U.S.
Labeling	AHA sends AHC-certified farms logo information that they can use to create their own labels.
Notes	Due to its fee structure, AHA counts only a few small producers among its total membership of 40 farms.
Contact Information	Web: http://thehumanetouch.org Phone: 800-227-4645 Email: info@americanhumane.org

6. Food Alliance

Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Food Alliance (FA) offers comprehensive certification programs that build upon USDA organic standards. FA standards appeal to North American producers whose values include minimization of environmental impact, the humane treatment of animals and fair labor practices. • Food Alliance's stated mission is to "...create market incentives for socially and environmentally responsible agricultural practices and educate business leaders and other food system stakeholders on the benefits of sustainable agriculture."
Animals	Beef cattle, dairy cows, bison, poultry, pigs, sheep and goats
Key Standards	FA's standards are continually evolving but include the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide safe and fair working conditions. • Ensure the health and humane treatment of animals. • Abstain from the use of hormones or antibiotic supplements. • Do not raise GMO crops or livestock. • Protect water resources. • Protect and enhance soil resources. • Provide wildlife habitat. • Continually improve practices.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review the Food Alliance Certification requirements for farms and ranches by reading the Producer Standards and Procedures. • Submit an application online using FA's Self Assessment Tool, or download application materials to print and mail. Along with the application, provide any supporting

	<p>documentation necessary, and include payment for the application fee.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Once FA has reviewed your application, they will forward the documents to an independent, third-party inspector who will contact you to schedule a site inspection. • During the inspection, the inspector will tour your operation, interview managers and staff, and review relevant records to evaluate compliance with FA certification standards. • After the visit, the inspector will submit an inspection report to Food Alliance. • Once the site report is received, FA will make a certification decision and inform you of the decision by mail. You will receive both a letter indicating the decision and a copy of the site report. • If you believe that the inspector’s findings are inaccurate or unfair, you may submit a request for re-evaluation to FA. This request must detail the perceived inaccuracies and be submitted within 30 days of receiving the site report. • If you are denied certification, you may reapply only after making changes to your operation, as suggested in the site report. • The term of certification for farmers and ranchers is three years. Food Alliance reserves the right to conduct unscheduled audits of participating farms and ranches. Operations are either selected at random or chosen based on concerns identified in the original site inspection. • Farmers must also complete annual updates to maintain certification; they must also report any changes to their operation and progress made toward their improvement goals.
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Independent farms and ranches pay an annual fee based on percentage of gross sales of certified products. The average cost is around \$400 per year and is assessed on a sliding percentage scale that declines as sales increase. • Producers seeking financial assistance with Food Alliance certification may be eligible for payments under the Conservation Security Program (CSP), authorized by the 2008 Farm Bill.
Timeline	<p>After submission of the initial application, the certification process usually takes between seven and nine weeks. However, this can vary and depends on factors such as the availability of the auditor and whether the application has been submitted during a seasonally appropriate time of the year.</p>
Scale Considerations	<p>Annual fees may make certification prohibitively expensive for some operations.</p>
Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large pasture acreage requirements per animal • Alterations or additions to animal facilities • Minimum space requirements for animals during transport
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Food Alliance’s strategic marketing emphasis differentiates it from other certification programs. The Alliance “operates an extensive market development program – connecting farmers and ranchers with consumers across the country.” • FA maintains partnerships with grocery chains, restaurants, national food service companies, wholesalers, food cooperatives and specialty stores. • FA provides its members a range of market support services, public relations efforts, marketing strategies and point-of-sale materials, while partners commit to sourcing and promoting FA certified products. • FA’s organization allows it to pool marketing dollars among food enterprises with shared values and common production practices.
Labeling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Food Alliance sends certified producers a PDF with which they can create labels. • FA maintains distinct guidelines for different steps of animal food production, as well as for different kinds of animal products (e.g. ground beef and beef jerky). A producer must receive approval from FA before using the Food Alliance label on any product.

Notes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are some concerns about the complexity of FA's program, particularly because FA continually changes its standards. • The certification process can be time-consuming.
Contact Information	Web: http://foodalliance.org Phone: 503-493-1066 Email: info@foodalliance.org .

7. Certified Naturally Grown

Summary	<p>Certified Naturally Grown (CNG) is a non-profit organization that offers certification tailored for small-scale, direct-market farmers and beekeepers using natural methods. CNG farms do not use any synthetic fertilizers, pesticides, herbicides, fungicides or GMO seeds, just like organic farms. Certified Naturally Grown is an independent program not affiliated with the National Organic Program.</p>
Animals	Same range of livestock as USDA Certified Organic
Key Standards	<p>The CNG standards are based on and nearly identical to the USDA National Organic Program standards, with a few modifications:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CNG maintains more stringent standards for living conditions and access to pasture. • Feed must be grown without synthetic fertilizers, pesticides, herbicides or GMO seeds, but it does not have to be certified organic. CNG made this exemption to encourage use of local sources. • CNG allows non-organic livestock to be brought into the operation only when there is no organic or naturally grown source for the sought-after livestock, the purpose of which is to encourage more farmers to grow naturally or organically. • A full list of CNG livestock standards is available on the CNG website: http://www.naturallygrown.org.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete the Livestock Certification Application online. Once accepted, your application becomes part of your online farm profile on the CNG website. This is a public document that you should keep updated to reflect your current practices. • Make a required contribution. You may wait until after your application is accepted to make your contribution. • Sign and return your declaration. Your signature indicates that you meet and agree to all CNG standards, as well as the terms of participating in the program. Declarations must be returned annually to maintain certification. A Feed Supplier Declaration is also required for livestock certification. • Arrange an on-farm inspection. All farms must arrange their own on-site inspection, which must take place within two growing season months of being accepted into the program, and at least once every 16 months thereafter. Inspections are conducted by CNG volunteers free of charge, typically by other CNG farmers. • Conduct an inspection. All farmers who participate in the CNG program agree to conduct at least one inspection of another CNG farm or apiary each year. This requirement is waived if there is not another CNG farm or apiary within a one hour drive.
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CNG requires an annual contribution for certification; the minimum for livestock certification is \$110. • On-site inspections are free.
Timeline	Acceptance into the CNG program occurs soon after submission of the application and prior to the initial on-site inspection.

Scale Considerations	The relatively low cost of membership and streamlined application process make the CNG program realistic for small farmers.
Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High organic feed costs • Large pasture acreage per animal • Alterations or additions to animal facilities • Adherence to specific animal health care standards
New Markets	As of January 2012, 30 Colorado farms were Certified Naturally Grown members.
Labeling	<p>Certified Naturally Grown offers members the following labeling products:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Non-laminated certificate (free) • Laminated certificate (\$7 each) • Laminated farm signs (\$7 each) • Market posters (\$7 each) • Bumper stickers (sliding price scale) • Rack cards (sliding price scale) • CNG sticker labels (large and small)
Contact Information	<p>http://www.naturallygrown.org Phone: 877-211-0308 Email: info@naturallygrown.org.</p>

8. AGA Grassfed and Pasture Finished

Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The American Grassfed Association (AGA) and Pasture Finished Ruminant Standards emphasize open pasture, humane animal care, preclusion of the use of antibiotics and hormones, the production of nutritious and healthy meats, and support for family farms. • The AGA defines grassfed products from ruminants, including cattle, bison, goats and sheep, as food products from animals whose diets have consisted exclusively of their mother’s milk and fresh grass or grass-type hay from their birth. • The AGA requires that animals’ diets consist solely of forage consisting of grass, forbs (e.g. legumes and brassicas, browse shrubs and trees, or cereal grain crops in the vegetative state. • Animals may not be fed grain. • Among the AGA’s top priorities is working with the USDA to establish a legal definition for “grassfed” and to implement a labeling program that benefits producers due to their ability to acquire a premium for products that meet the criteria, while providing a service to consumers who wish to buy grassfed products. • The majority of AGA Certified members are family cattle farms with 50 to 300 head of cattle. AGA also counts among its membership one large sheep producer and several bison producers.
Animals	Beef cattle, bison, lamb, pork, poultry, eggs and dairy products.
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AGA Grassfed and Pasture Finished Ruminant Standards must be maintained 8 out of 10 years for producers to remain certified. • Animals live their entire lives on open pastures. • There is no extended or routine confinement of any animal. • No animal byproducts may be included in the animals’ diets. • No antibiotics or synthetic hormones may be administered. • The abuse of any animal is prohibited. • The non-emergency use of electric prods or hot shots is prohibited.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A detailed list of AGA certification standards can be found on the AGA website: http://www.americangrassfed.org.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review the AGA certification standards and, if recertifying, make sure your AGA membership is up-to-date. Complete and submit your application. If you have any questions about the application, call AGA at 202-546-5292 or write them at aga@americangrassfed.org. AWA acts as the third-party verifying agency for AGA certification applications. After AWA verifies that you are an AGA member, they will call you to schedule an on-site audit. The audit typically takes 1-4 hours. AWA sends audit results to the AGA Certification Committee to determine whether or not you qualify for AGA grassfed certification. If you do, AGA will send you a certificate of approval, along with a Licensing Agreement. If you do not qualify, the AGA Certification Committee or the AWA will explain what adjustments are necessary for you to successfully complete the audit. Fill out and send back the licensing agreement to AGA, with the licensing fee. Once you are certified and licensed, you can use the AGA Logo on your labels and promotional materials.
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Certified Producer members pay an annual \$250 membership fee. In addition, certified producer members pay a per-head fee for every animal harvested for the certified grassfed program. This fee will be determined by the AGA certification committee. Currently certified producer members who already have paid their \$100 annual membership dues will pay the remaining \$150 after re-passing the audit.
Timeline	After submission of the original application, the certification process typically takes 4-8 weeks.
Scale Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The fee schedule may make membership prohibitively expensive for small farming operations. Securing adequate pasture may be difficult for operations raising larger livestock.
Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Large pasture acreage per animal Alterations or additions to animal facilities Adherence to specific animal health care standards
New Markets	As of January 2012, 13 Colorado producers were AGA Grassfed certified members.
Labeling	Once certified and licensed, a producer can use the AGA Grassfed Logo on labels and promotional materials. This logo distinguishes AGA certified products from those only labeled "grassfed."
Notes	Among the AGA's top priorities is working with the USDA to establish a legal definition for "grassfed."
Contact Information	Web: http://www.americangrassfed.org Phone: 877-774-7277 Email: aga@americangrassfed.org

9. Kosher

9. Kosher	
Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Kosher foods are those that are processed and prepared according to the customs and beliefs of the Jewish faith. The humane treatment and slaughter of animals is a key requirement of the kosher designation.

Animals	Includes members of the bovine, goat, sheep and buffalo family. Pigs are excluded as they do not chew their own cud.
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meat from an animal certified as kosher requires that the animal have split hooves and chew its cud. • Livestock must be inspected, slaughtered and prepared by a qualified specialist. • Kosher birds must have a crop, an extra finger, a gizzard that can be peeled, and must not be a bird of prey.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Farms themselves typically are not certified kosher. Rather, kosher certification is granted to non-farm producers and processors. • Kosher animal products must pass inspection by an agency or individuals authorized by the Jewish hierarchy. • The certification process for animal products includes the following steps for the four agencies listed below: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Submit an online application. ○ The agency will contact the producer/processor to begin the review process. ○ The agency conducts a thorough inspection of the processing equipment. ○ The agency submits a contract proposal outlining the terms for kosher certification. ○ After all terms have been satisfied, the agency sends a letter of certification that authorizes the use of its label on all approved products.
Certifying Agencies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While individuals rabbis can certify foods as being kosher, four of the world's largest Kosher-certifying agencies known for their stringent standards operate in the U.S.: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Orthodox Union of New York City (http://www.ou.org/) ○ The Chicago Rabbinical Council (http://www.crcweb.org/) ○ Kof-K Kosher Supervision (http://www.kof-k.org/) ○ Star-K (http://www.star-k.org/)
Fees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Audit fees typically are assessed directly to processors and not farms.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Higher slaughtering costs
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kosher packaged foods typically carry a 10-25 percent premium over non-Kosher foods. • Many non-Jewish consumers purchase kosher foods for their perceived high quality. • According to the consumer market firm <i>Packaged Facts</i>, sales of certified kosher foods rose from nearly \$150 billion in 2003 to more than \$200 billion in 2008, demonstrating a compound annual growth rate twice that of the overall food market. • <i>Packaged Facts</i> attributes the increase in kosher food sales largely to a growing number of consumers who deliberately seek out kosher foods.
Labeling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Kosher "K," indicating "Kosher," carries little weight with many observing Jews. Any cook or food processor can label their product "K," as inspection by a certifying agency is not required. • Kosher labeling by leading certifying agencies ensures compliance with kosher standards.

10. Halal and Zabiha Halal

Summary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Halal foods are those that are processed and prepared according to the customs and beliefs of the Muslim faith. • Definitions of Halal and Zabiha Halal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ In Arabic, “halal” means that which is allowed, permitted, or permissible.” ○ Zabiha refers specifically to the slaughter of an animal by slitting its throat. As such, zabiha is the acceptable practice of butchering animals according to the Islamic faith.
Animals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Almost all livestock products are halal except the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Pig products ○ Animals improperly slaughtered or dead before slaughter • Birds of prey and carnivorous animals are not halal.
Key Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Dhabiha” is the prescribed method of slaughtering all animals, excluding fish and most sea-life, per Islamic law. This method of slaughtering animals consists of using a well sharpened knife to make a swift, deep incision that cuts the front of the throat, the carotid artery, wind pipe and jugular veins but leaves the spinal cord intact. • The head of an animal that is slaughtered using halal methods is aligned with the Qiblah (the direction a Muslim should face when praying). • In addition to the direction, permitted animal should be slaughtered in the name of Allah (the Lord), and the person who is slaughtering should be a Muslim.
Certification Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Farms themselves are not designated “halal.” Rather, halal certification is granted to non-farm producers and processors. • IFANCA’s certification process (see below) consists of the following steps: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Complete an online application for certification. ○ Arrange for an audit/inspection of the facility, through which IFANCA reviews the process, products, materials and sanitation of the production process. ○ Provide additional information, such as specification sheets, labels, flow charts, cleaning procedures, etc. ○ Negotiate an agreement, including the fees involved. ○ A halal certificate is issued either for one year or for each batch produced, depending on the type of product.
Certifying Agencies	The Islamic Food and Nutrition Council of America (IFANCA) is the leading certifier of halal foods in the U.S. (http://www.ifanca.org)
Fees	Supervision fees assessed by IFANCA vary according to the number and complexity of the products to be certified.
Potential Production Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Higher slaughtering costs
New Markets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Once a product is halal-certified, IFANCA lists the company and product on its website. • Halal-certified foods typically carry a premium over non-halal foods. • Several major retailers carry halal products, including Safeway, Walmart, ShopRite, Costco, SuperSaver and Whole Foods Market. • With approximately 10 million Muslims living in the U.S., and more than 1.5 billion overseas, a large potential market exists for retailers of halal products.
Labeling	Once a product is certified, permission is granted to display the IFANCA certification logo, the

	Crescent M, on the product packaging and label.
Notes	Halal consumption is not limited only to the Muslim population; other consumer groups are seeking halal food due to its reputation for healthy and safe food products, as well as the humane treatment of animals.
Contact Information	IFANCA Web: http://www.ifanca.org IFANCA Phone: 847-993-0034

III. Comparison of Animal Welfare Standards by Program

Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Certified Humane	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Entry into program	Pass/fail. All standards must be met.	Pass/fail. All standards must be met.	Five-Step Program. All standards applicable to any range of steps must be met.	Pass/fail. All standards must be met.	Farms are audited on a percentage basis. Farms that do not meet all areas of compliance have 90 days to make corrections.
Traceability: Birth through Slaughter Management	Animal must be audited from birth through slaughter.	Animal must be audited from birth through slaughter.	Unclear. Step-rated farms may be able to buy animals from non-step-rated farms and then sell them on the step rating.	Animal must be audited throughout life, from last third of gestation through slaughter.	Unclear. Standards and audit are included on one form. No standards specified regarding slaughter.
Growth Hormones	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited
Antibiotics	Prohibited except for disease treatment of individual animal.	Prohibited except for disease treatment of individual animal.	Prohibited	Prohibited	Beef: Prohibited except for disease treatment. Chickens: allowed Pigs: Prohibited except for disease treatment
Humane Euthanasia	Required when animal would otherwise suffer	Required when animal would otherwise suffer	Required when animal would otherwise suffer	Not addressed	Required when animal would otherwise suffer

Living Conditions – Beef Cattle

Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Certified Humane	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Pasture/range Requirement	Beef cattle must be raised on range as well as grass and not indoors. Some producers finish their cattle on small feedyards.	All animals must be pasture raised.	Can be raised on range or grass and can be feedyard finished.	30% of dry matter intake must come from pasture during the grazing season, which must be a minimum of 120 days per year.	Beef cattle are raised on range and usually not indoors.
Required Protection from Wind/Shade Requirement	Windbreaks required Shade required	Windbreaks required Shade required	Windbreaks not required Shade not required	Windbreaks required Shade required	Windbreaks required Shade required
Stocking Density	On feedyards and when housed: Specific allowances for beef cattle based on animal based on size, weight and slope of ground	Cattle cannot be finished on feedyards. When housed: Specific space allowances depending animal weight and size	On feedyards: 250 sq/ft. per animal regardless of size or age.	On feedyards: not addressed When housed: Not addressed	On feedyards and when housed: Calculated on slope/size/range
Disbudding	Hot iron only method allowed and must be done during first 4 months of life. After 4 months of age must use anesthesia and be done by a veterinarian.	Hot iron only method allowed. Must be done during first 2 months of life and with anesthesia.	Allowed prior to 6 weeks of age; no restriction on method.	Permitted	Hot iron only method allowed during first 4 months of life. After 4 months of age must use anesthesia and be done by a veterinarian.
Castration	Must be done during first 2 months of life. After 2 months, must be done with anesthetic with surgical removal or spermatic cord crush. Rubber rings: can only be used for castrating	Must be done less than 2 months of age. Rubber rings: can only be used for castrating prior to one week of age.	Permitted prior to 6 months of age without anesthesia. Rubber rings: Permitted prior to 6 months of age without anesthesia.	Permitted	Must be done less than 2 months of age. Rubber rings: Must be used during first week of life.

	prior to one week of age.				
Health Care Must Include Disease/Parasite Prevention?	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Transportation Time to Slaughter	Must be kept to a minimum but not defined	Maximum transport time of 8 hours	25 hours	Not addressed	Not addressed
Slaughter (American Meat Institute (AMI) Guidelines)	Facilities audited by HFAC to make sure AMI Guidelines are being met	Facilities audited by AWA	Not addressed	Not addressed	Unclear whether AHC performs slaughter audits

Living Conditions - Chickens					
Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Certified Humane	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Outdoor Access	Not required Specific standards for free range claims Indoor systems: Specific air quality, litter and air quality standards	Standards require that all birds are pasture raised	Not addressed	Required	Not addressed
Litter Management and Ammonia Levels	Litter management program required Ammonia level: Maximum 10 ppm, no higher than 25 ppm for brief periods	Litter management program required Ammonia level: Housing must be managed to eliminate ammonia above the 5 ppm detectable level	No litter management program required No ammonia level requirement	No litter requirement, but must provide clean bedding Ammonia level requirement not addressed	Litter management program required Ammonia level not to exceed 25 ppm
Space Allowances	6 lbs per 1 sq. ft.	0.67 sq. ft per bird roosting plus an outdoor range area	No specific space allowance required	Not addressed	7.0 lbs per 1 sq. ft.
Sleep Period Requirement	Minimum of 6 hours of darkness in every 24-hour period	Minimum of 8 continuous hours of darkness in every 24-hour period	Not addressed	Not addressed	Minimum 6 hours dark period every 24 hours

Catching of Birds for Transport	Birds must be caught individually and carried by both legs	Birds must be caught individually and carried by both legs	Not addressed	Not addressed	No more than 3 birds carried in one hand
--	--	--	---------------	---------------	--

Living Conditions - Pigs					
Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Certified Humane	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Outdoor Access Requirement	Standards for both indoor and outdoor systems; neither is required.	All animals must be pasture raised	Not addressed	Required	Not required
Space Allowances for Housed Animals	Depends on weight/size of animal	Depends on weight/size of animal	Not addressed	Not addressed	Gestating Sows: 20 sq. ft. indoor or outdoor. Also may be held in gestating stalls for first 35 days of pregnancy
Wallows	Required for all pigs in outdoor systems	Required for all pigs	Not addressed	Not addressed	Not required
Tail Docking	Not allowed	Not allowed	Not allowed	Allowed	Allowed
Nose Rings	Prohibited	A single septum ring permitted only to prevent soil damage or environmental pollution.	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed
Ear Notching	Prohibited	Permitted Prohibited when carried out with a knife	Permitted	Permitted	Permitted
Castration	Must be performed at less than 7 days of age	Must be performed at less than 7 days of age	Must be performed at less than 7 days of age	Allowed	Must be performed at less than 7 days of age
Weaning	Minimum weaning age of 28 days	Minimum weaning age of 42 days	Minimum weaning age of 28 days	Not addressed	Minimum weaning age of 21 days
Air Quality	Max 10 ppm ammonia levels	Max 5 ppm ammonia levels	No formal target level required	Not addressed	Max 25 ppm ammonia levels
Environment Enrichment	Environment must allow pigs to express natural behaviors.	All pigs kept on range and foraging area must provide foraging and rooting opportunities.	Not addressed	Not addressed	Straw or other suitable material, or balls and hanging chains required.

Health Care Must Include Disease/Parasite Prevention?	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Transportation Time to Slaughter	Must be kept to a minimum. No maximum time specified.	Maximum transport time of 8 hours	Maximum transport time of 14 hours	Not addressed	Not addressed
Slaughter	Facilities are audited by HFAC to ensure American Meat Institute (AMI) standards are met.	Facilities are audited by AWA.	No slaughter requirements or inspections	Not addressed	Unclear whether AHC performs any slaughter audits

Living Conditions – Goats & Sheep					
Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Certified Humane	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Outdoor Access Requirement	Must have access to pasture and exercise area as climate and geographic area allow	Continuous outdoor pasture is required	n/a (no certification program for goats or sheep)	Required	Must have access to pasture during grass-growing season
Feed	Must meet or exceed nutrition requirements defined by National Research Council	Goats must be provided with 70% long fiber roughage/forage in their diet on a daily dry matter basis from weaning onwards	n/a	Animals must receive at least 30% of dry matter intake from grazing during the grazing season	Animals must be provided with feed or forage with adequate fiber to allow rumination
Indoor Air Quality	Ammonia may not exceed 15 ppm	When animals are sheltered, ammonia must be removed from the air in the facility	n/a	Not addressed	Ammonia must not exceed 25 ppm
Floor Space	At least 1.5 times the animal's lying area	2.5 m ² recommended for adult goats and sheep	n/a	Not addressed	At least 1.5 times the animal's lying area
Minimum Bedded Space	Goats: 1.7 m ² per adult doe 2.8 – 3.7 m ² for bucks	1.5 m ²	n/a	Not addressed	Goats: 1.1 – 1.4 m ² per dry doe

	Sheep: 1.1 - 1.4 m ² per dry ewe 1.9 - 3.0 m ² per ram				1.9 - 3.0 m ² per buck Sheep: Of sufficient size to accommodate all sheep lying down together in normal resting posture
Confinement	Only permitted for feeding, medical treatment or other temporary activities	Only permitted for medical treatment Confinement feeding is not permitted	n/a	Not addressed	Only permitted for feeding, medical treatment or other temporary activities
Castration	Only permitted during first 7 days of animal's life	Only permitted during first 7 days of animal's life	n/a	Not addressed	Only permitted during first 7 days of animal's life
Tail Docking (sheep)	Only permitted if there is high risk of suffering due to fly strike	Prohibited	n/a	Not addressed	Only permitted if there is high risk of suffering due to fly strike
Dehorning	Allowed	Prohibited	n/a	Not addressed	Prohibited
Ear Marking	Allowed	Prohibited	n/a	Not addressed	Allowed
Transportation Time to Slaughter	Not addressed	Must not exceed 8 hours	n/a	Not addressed	Not addressed
Hoof Inspection	Required periodically	All animals must be inspected daily Hoof inspections must be carried out by a skilled practitioner	n/a	Not addressed	Required annually

Living Conditions - Turkeys					
Animal Welfare Standard	HFAC Humane Certifies	Animal Welfare Approved	Global Animal Partnership	USDA Organic	American Humane Certified
Outdoor Access	Not required	Must be pasture raised	Not addressed	Not addressed	Not addressed
Sleep Period	Must have 8 hours continuous darkness	Must have normal daylight and nighttime hours	6 hours	Not addressed	6 hours
Litter Management & Ammonia Levels	Litter management program required	If housed during emergencies, ammonia	No litter management program required	Not addressed	Ammonia levels cannot exceed 25 ppm

	Ammonia levels must be tested and recorded no higher than 10 ppm	levels cannot exceed 5 ppm	Ammonia levels may not exceed 10 ppm		
Space Allowance	7.5 lbs/sq. ft.	Outdoor area; 5 sq. ft per bird	10.0 lbs/sq. ft.	Not addressed	13-17 lbs: 2.0 sq.ft per bird 17-26 lbs: 3.0 sq.ft. per bird
Beak Trimming	Allowed prior to 10 days of age	Prohibited	Allowed	Not addressed	Allowed
Toe Trimming	Prohibited	Prohibited	Allowed	Not addressed	Allowed
Catching for Transport	Specific catching instructions, including space allowances Prohibits feed withdrawal prior to 12 hours of catching	Specific catching instructions Prohibits feed withdrawal prior to 12 hours of catching	Specific catching instructions; no space requirements Prohibits feed withdrawal prior to 12 hours of catching	Not addressed	Specific catching instructions Prohibits feed withdrawal prior to 16 hours of catching
Slaughter Standards and Inspection?	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes

IV. Characteristics of Poultry Certifications and Labels

Poultry Labels							
Label	Uncaged?	Required Outdoor Access?	Diet	Beak Cutting Permitted?	Forced Molting through Starvation Permitted?	Certifying Body	Other
AGA Grassfed	Yes	Yes	Grass is a significant component	Not addressed	No	AGA	The AGA Grassfed label denotes official certification, whereas the label “grassfed” does not.
American Humane Certified	Not addressed	No	Freedom from hunger and thirst required	Yes	No	American Humane Association	Allows both cage confinement and cage-free systems.
Animal Welfare Approved	Yes	Yes		No	No	Animal Welfare Approved	Highest animal welfare standards of any third-party auditing program
Cage Free	Yes	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	Can engage in some natural behaviors
Certified Humane	Yes	No	Not addressed	Yes	No	Humane Farm Animal Care	Requirements for stocking density and number of perches and nesting boxes
Certified Naturally Grown	Not addressed	Yes	No synthetic fertilizers, pesticides, herbicides or GMO seeds	Yes	Yes	Certified Naturally Grown	Poultry or edible poultry products must be from poultry that has been under continuous CNG management beginning no later than the second day of life.
Certified Organic	Yes	Yes	Organic, all-vegetarian, free of antibiotics and pesticides	Yes	Yes	USDA	There are concerns about lax enforcement of requirement for birds to have outdoor access.
Fertile	Typically yes	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	“Fertile” eggs are laid by hens that have lived with roosters. They usually are not caged.

Poultry Labels							
Label	Uncaged?	Required Outdoor Access?	Diet	Beak Cutting Permitted?	Forced Molting through Starvation Permitted?	Certifying Body	Other
Food Alliance	Yes	Yes	Organic, all-vegetarian, free of antibiotics and pesticides	Yes	Yes	Food Alliance	Follows almost all Certified Organic standards
Free Range	Yes	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	No standards for “free range” egg production.
Grassfed	Not addressed	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	The USDA currently has no formal standards for use of the label “grassfed.” The American Grassfed Association is pushing the USDA to adopt a formal definition.
Natural	Not addressed	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	This label has no relevance to animal welfare.
Omega-3 Enriched	Not addressed	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	None	This label has no relevance to animal welfare.
United Egg Producers Certified	Not addressed	No	Not addressed	Yes	Yes	United Egg Producers	Each hen is afforded 67 square inches of cage space. Permits inhumane factory farm practices.
Vegetarian-Fed	Not addressed	No	Feed does not contain animal byproducts	Yes	Yes	None	This label has little relevance to animal welfare.

V. Glossary

American Grassfed Association (AGA) Grassfed and Pasture Finished Ruminant Standards

The American Grassfed Association (AGA) Grassfed and Pasture Finished Ruminant Standards emphasize open pasture, humane animal care, preclusion of the use of antibiotics and hormones, the production of nutritious and healthy meats, and support for family farms. Products from grassfed animals include beef, bison, lamb, pork, poultry, eggs and dairy products.

American Humane Certified

The American Humane Certified program (formerly known as the Free Farmed program) provides third-party, independent verification that certified producers' care and handling of farm animals meet the science-based animal welfare standards of American Humane Association.

Animal Welfare Approved

AWA is an organization that audits and certifies family farms' humane treatment of their animals according to the standards of the World Society for the Protection of Animals. AWA is the only free third-party animal welfare certification program.

Be Local Northern Colorado

Be Local NC is a Fort Collins-based non-profit organization whose mission is to help develop the economy of independent, uniquely local businesses and farms through its business network which provides community advocacy, consumer education, and business promotion. Be Local NC can be reached at 970-219-3382 or by email at info@belocalnc.org.

Cage-free

Laying hens are "cage-free" as long as they are not at any time confined to cages. However, this designation implies nothing about other aspects of the birds' welfare.

Certified

The term "certified" implies that the USDA's Food Safety and Inspection Service and the Agriculture Marketing Service have officially evaluated a meat product for class, grade, or other quality characteristics. When used under other circumstances, the term must be closely associated with the name of the organization responsible for the certification process, e.g., "HFAC Certified Humane."

Certified Humane

Certified Humane is a certification and labeling program whose stated goal is to improve the lives of farm animals by driving consumer demand for kinder and more responsible farm animal practices and to assure consumers that certified products meet the Certified Humane standards.

Certified Naturally Grown:

Certified Naturally Grown (CNG) is a non-profit organization that offers certification tailored for small-scale, direct-market farmers and beekeepers using natural methods. CNG farms do not use any synthetic fertilizers, pesticides, herbicides, fungicides or GMO seeds, just like organic farms.

Colorado Organic

This logo may be used only to market Colorado agricultural products that have been certified by a federally accredited organic certification program.

Colorado Proud

A free marketing program offered by the Colorado Department of Agriculture that is designed to help consumers, restaurants and retailers identify and purchase Colorado food and agricultural products.

Food Alliance

Food Alliance (FA) offers comprehensive certification programs that build upon USDA organic standards. FA standards appeal to North American producers whose values include minimization of environmental impact, the humane treatment of animals, and fair labor practices.

Free-Range

According to the USDA, free-range poultry must be allowed access to the outside. However, it is not specified that poultry have access to grass or other pasture. By definition, other free-range livestock are those that are allowed to roam freely and are not confined in any manner. However, the USDA definition applies only to poultry.

Global Animal Partnership

Global Animal Partnership is a nonprofit organization founded in 2008 with the goal of wanting to improve the welfare of animals in agriculture. Comprised of farmers, scientists, ranchers, retailers and animal advocates, Global Animal Partnership's 5-Step Animal Welfare Rating Standards program recognizes and rewards producers for their welfare practices, promotes and facilitates continuous improvement, and better informs consumers about various production systems. Independent, third-party certification companies perform the audits of animal production operations.

Grassfed

The term "grassfed" currently does not imply adherence to official standards. The American Grassfed Association, through its AGA Grassfed certification program, is pushing the USDA to adopt a formal definition for "grassfed."

Grass Finished

Grass-finished beef comes from cattle that have been raised on a forage diet their entire lives. While most cattle spend the majority of their lives in pastures eating grass before moving to a feedlot for grain-finishing, grass-finished beef cattle remain on a pasture and forage diet.

Halal and Zabiah Halal

Products prepared by federally inspected meat packing plants identified with labels bearing references to "Halal" or "Zabiah Halal" must be handled according to Islamic law and under Islamic authority.

Heritage

Heritage breeds are traditional livestock breeds with unique genetic traits that were raised by farmers in the past, before the reduction of breed variety caused by the rise of industrial agriculture. However, there is no official definition or certification for “heritage” animals.

Humanely Raised

An unregulated term implying the humane treatment of food production animals.

Kosher

Kosher foods are those that are processed and prepared according to the customs and beliefs of the Jewish faith. Kosher animal products must pass inspection by an agency or individuals authorized by the Jewish hierarchy.

Natural

“Natural” is a commonly used label by food producers but has no relevance to animal welfare. Thus, it can be misleading to consumers and does not signify product differentiation for producers.

No Antibiotics

The terms “no antibiotics added” may be used on labels for meat or poultry products if sufficient documentation is provided by the producer to the USDA demonstrating that the animals were raised without antibiotics.

No Hormones

The term “no hormones administered” may be approved for use on the label of beef products if sufficient documentation is provided to the USDA by the producer showing no hormones have been used in raising the animals. Since hormones are not allowed in the raising of pigs or poultry, the label “no hormones added” can only be used if it is followed by the statement, “Federal regulations prohibit the use of hormones.”

Omega-3 Eggs

An unregulated term that does not necessarily imply that hens are pastured.

Pasture Raised (or Pastured)

According to the USDA, “pasture raised” hens “...are raised outdoors using movable enclosures located on grass and fed an organic diet (free of hormones or non-organic additives) and/or raised without antibiotics.”

USDA Organic

The 1990 Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA) established uniform national standards for the production and handling of foods labeled as “organic.” The Act authorized a new USDA National Organic Program (NOP) to set national standards for the production, handling and processing of organically grown agricultural products. Producers who meet standards set by the NOP may label their products as “USDA Certified Organic.”